The Ouarterly Journal of Philosophical Investigations

University of Tabriz-Iran

ISSN (print): 2251-7960 ISSN (online): 2423-4419 Journal Homepage: www.philosophy.Tabrizu.ac.ir



مجله علم*ی پژوهشهای فلسفی* دانشگاه تبریز

Vol. 14/ Issue: 32/ autumn 2020



Does Shahrazuri Follow the Illuminationist Descendants on Celestial Beings in *alRumuz*

Received date: 2019.6.23 Accepted date: 2020.11.14

PP.109-116

DOI: 10.22034/jpiut.2020.41138.2642

Nadia Maftooni (Responsible author)

Associate Professor at Department of Philosophy and Islamic Kalam university of Tehran-Iran nadia.maftouni@ut.ac.ir

Mahmoud Edris

PhD candidate, Department of Philosophy and Islamic Kalam university of Tehran-Iran edrismahmoud@gmail.com

Abstract

Considered the second face of Illumination philosophy after the Shaykh al-Ishraq Suhrawardi (1154-1191), Muhammad Ibn Mahmud Shams al-Din al-Shahrazuri (d. after 1288), in most part, hold fast to Suhrawardi's illuminationist doctrines. As a case study on celestial bodies, the allegiance may well be at question level. The nine celestial spheres and sublunary world held managed by ten separated intelligences. Suhrawardi depicted the celestial spheres in his allegorical works. Suhrawardi usually speaks of eleven symbols, for instance, eleven mountains in "The Red Intellect" and the eleven layers of a basin in "The Sound of Gabriel's Wing". But the eleven celestial bodies, including ether and zamharir rule out Divine Pedestal (al-kursi) and Divine Throne (al-'arsh) of Muhyiddin al-Andalusi. Surprisingly, in his mystic work called Kitah al-Rumuz wa-l-Amthal al-Lahutiyya fil-Anwar al-Mujarradat al-Malakutiyya, Shams al-Din al-Shahrazuri nor except in passing has considered the celestial bodies. In al-Rumuz of Shahrazuri, the number of celestial beings has not been mentioned. Speaking of Divine Pedestal (al-kursi) and Divine Throne (al-'arsh) of Ibn Arabi, Shahrazuri does not consider zamharir and ether.

Keywords: Suhrawardi, Ibn Arabi, Shahrazuri, *al-Rumuz wa-l-Amthal* al-L*ahutiyya*, celestial bodies.

Every subject offers reasons for colour, shape and texture . . . I can explore in paint, think in terms of paint as an alternative to a purely representational view. (Hill, 2006)

1. Introduction

As the second master of philosophy of Illumination, Muhammad Ibn Mahmud Shams al-Din al-Shahrazuri is believed loyal to Suhrawardi. As a case study on celestial bodies, the allegiance may well be at question level. In this research, we are charitably regarding another prominent mystic figure, i.e. Ibn Arabi, as Shahrazuri's descendant. A near contemporary of Shahab al-Din Yahya Suhrawardi, the founder of the philosophical School of Illumination in the Islamic East, Ibn Arabi are placed in the same spiritual family. (Corbin, H., 1981, p. 20)

In traditional doctrines, the nine celestial bodies and sublunary world managed by ten separated intelligences are on the well known descending route of the Origin. As it is mentioned: "The basic outline is the same as that already present in the Arabic Plotinus: intellect, soul, heavenly spheres, four elements.... Some of the philosophers have developed it into several degrees as did Farabi and Avicenna, who spoke not of one intellect and one soul, but of ten intellects and ten souls." (Chittick, W., 2001, p. 57)

The Peripatetic philosophers believed in ten separated intelligences emanate from the First Being. The tenth one, the Active Intellect, gives rise to the sublunary realm. (Ibn Sina, H., 2007, pp. 386-393) The philosophers did not assert that they were acquainted with the manner in which all the other numerous existents emanated, but concerned themselves only with the nine spheres. They have claimed ten separated intelligences, only because it is impossible for there to be less than that in view of the nine universal spheres and the sublunary realm. (Al-Jami, A., 1979, p. 69)

Having both artistic and philosophical approach, Suhrawardi conveys mystical experiences and rational topics with literature. For instance, he has repeated attempts to allegorize his cosmology in the six visionary and mystical treatises: "The Sound of Gabriel's Wing", "The Red Intellect", "A Day with a Group of Sufis", "On the State of Childhood", "On the Reality of Love", and "The Language of the Ants".

Some of his allegories might be depicted by Ibn Arabi's view. Suhrawardi, like Ibn Arabi, underlines the symmetry of the spheres relative to Sun. Moreover, Suhrawardi speaks of eleven spheres. Do eleven layers of a basin in "The Sound of Gabriel's Wing" and eleven mountains in "The Red Intellect" allude to Ibn Arabi's doctrine? At last, did Shahrazuri show loyalty to Suhrawardi and/or Ibn Arabi?

Shaykh al-Ishraq on Celestial Bodies

Suhrawardi in the book of *Hikmah al-Ishraq* offers that the separated intelligences are more than ten, twenty, and two hundred. (Suhrawardi, S., 2002a, pp. 139-140) In *Alvah Emadi,* (Suhrawardi, S., 2002b, pp. 148-149; Suhrawardi, S., 2002c, p. 65) he also emphasizes that there are too many separated intelligences, quoting Quran's verse: "None knows the armies of your Lord save Himself." (Quran, 74/31) Therefore, the heavenly bodies would be more than nine. Because separated intelligences figure corresponds to spheres figure. But in his allegorical treatises, Suhrawardi symbolizes the theory of the nine spheres and ten separated intelligences.

The multiplicity of separated intelligences and angels could be seen in other opinions: "In his Hebrew adaptation of Avicenna's Hayy Ibn Yaqzan, Ibn Ezra describes the nine spheres, followed by the supernal world of the various groups of angels beyond

the spheres, and culminating with God. While Ibn Ezra does not explain these classes, they probable should be understood in terms of the Aristotelian view adopted by Avicenna of the Separate Intellects who are the Movers of the spheres. Ibn Ezra does not attempt to list ten classes of angels, corresponding to the Separate Intellects (nine Movers of the spheres and the Active Intellect) in Islamic Aristotelian philosophy." (Kreisel, H., 2009, p. 32).

In "A Day with a Group of Sufis" Suhrawardi himself has decoded his allegories about this theory. First, he mentions the theory in allegorical form.

When the wayfarer said to his master, "The engraver's craft is amazing." his master said, "There is a well-known tale in their craft, but no one tells it fully, and no one knows the meaning of it." "What is this tale?" the wayfarer asked. His master went through the story:

Once, an engraver had a jewel. He wanted to display his skill on it. So from it he made a round shell like a ball. Then, from the residue left in the middle of the shell he made another shell inside the first. Again, from the residue of the second he made a third, and so on until he had made nine shells. Afterwards, from the remainder of these shells he made a jewel, which he wrapped in two pieces of cloth, one of which had no color and the other of which was whitish. These he placed in the middle of the shells. He then polished the first shell and engraved a few medallions on the second shell and gilded it. On the third, fourth, and so on to the ninth shells he engraved one medallion each.

After the allegorical tale, Suhrawardi starts decoding it. When the wayfarer heard the tale from his master, he said, "I do not understand what you are saying to me. Tell me clearly that I may benefit fully." His master started explaining the allegories, "When the Creator created these spheres, he sent a light to the first sphere." For a sphere is an intermediary between being and non-being, the first sphere was too subtle to bear it. It borders on existence. Then again, it is continuous with nonexistence. As a consequence, the light reached the second sphere, which was able to bear it.

The light was broken up against the second sphere, and every part became a star. What was left over from these stars, came to the third sphere, and from that residue Saturn came into being. Again, what was left over from Saturn reached the fourth sphere, and the body of Jupiter came into being. And so on, Mars from residue of Jupiter, the Sun from the residue of Mars, Venus from the residue of the Sun, Mercury from the residue of Venus, and from the residue of Mercury, the Moon. (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, pp. 34-35)

Sometimes Suhrawardi speaks of the eleven spheres. In "A Day with a Group of Sufis", the wayfarer asked, "Why is the body of the Sun bigger and brighter than the other stars?" His master said "Because it is in the middle. If you count the seven planets, the Sun is in the middle. And just as there are two spheres above the seven, there are two other spheres below them, *ether* and *zamharir*. Therefore, by any reckoning the Sun is in the middle." (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, p. 36) Suhrawardi, in this passage, underlines the symmetry of eleven spheres relative to Sun. Hence he is clear about the topic, Suhrawardi's symbols may be decoded and corresponded the allegories to the nine and eleven celestial spheres. However, it seems obvious that his eleven celestial spheres differ from those of Ibn Arabi including *al-kursi* and *al-arsh*. (Ibn Arabi, M., 1919, p. 59)

In "A Day with a Group of Sufis", the nine shells symbolizes the nine spheres. The first shell is polished, and there are a few medallions on the second shell. On the third, fourth, and so on to the ninth shells, there is one medallion.

Cosmology issues in Suhrawardi's writings encompasses "A Day with a Group of Sufis" and these five other treatises: "The Sound of Gabriel's Wing", "The Red Intellect", "On the State of Childhood", "On the Reality of Love", and "The Language of the Ants".

We have just explained the account of "A Day with a Group of Sufis". "The Sound of Gabriel's Wing" is the next treatise in my account.

In this treatise, ten separated intelligences are symbolized by ten old men seating on a bench. The wayfarer says of them, "When I looked I saw ten old men of beautiful countenance seated on a bench. I was so amazed by their magnificence and splendor and so staggered by the sight of their throne, their beauty, their white hair, their garments and trappings that I could not speak." (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, pp. 9-10)

The old man who was on the end of the bench greeted the wayfarer in a most kindly-disposed manner, saying, "We are a group of abstracted ones, come from the direction of Nakuja-abad (Nowheresville)." that means they are ten separated intelligences.

"Why do the elders seated above you keep silent?" The wayfarer asked. "Because the likes of you are unworthy to approach them," the tenth and last of them, the Active Intellect said, "I serve as their tongue, for they will never deign to address the likes of you."

Then the wayfarer saw in the courtyard a basin with eleven layers. (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, p. 11) By these eleven layers, Suhrawardi allegorizes the eleven spheres. There is no crack or no crevice on the surface of the upper nine levels of the basin. This means there is no crack and no crevice on the surface of nine spheres according to traditional theory. "Although no hole could be made through the nine upper levels, one could easily pierce through the lowest level." (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, pp. 10-12) For the lowest level refers to the sublunary world.

The first level had no button at all, whereas the second level had many luminous buttons on it. Because the first level of the basin is the allegory of the Sphere of the spheres and the second level is the allegory of the sphere of the Fixed Stars.

"On each of the remaining seven of the upper nine levels of the basin a bright button was fastened." These buttons refer to Saturn, Jupiter, Mars, Sun, Venus, Mercury, and Moon.

When the wayfarer asks the old man what this basin is, he explains the relation between the separated intelligences and the spheres.

"The first layer," he said, "whose body is greater than any of the other levels, was arranged and put together by the old man who is seated at the highest level. The second was done by the second one, the third by the third, and so on down to me. These nine comrades and companions produced the nine layers by their own labor and handicraft. The two bottom levels, along with the bit of water and sand, were produced by me. Since their foundation is stronger, their handiwork cannot be rent or pierced, but what I have made can be."

Then he explains the relation between the separated intelligences themselves. The elder who is in the highest place is the master teacher and tutor of the second elder, who sits beside him. He has signed the second elder's order of investiture, the second has signed the third's order, the third the fourth's order, and so on down to the tenth.

The next allegories of the spheres, in "The Sound of Gabriel's Wing", are the son as the soul of the sphere and the mill as the body of the sphere.

"Do you have children and property and things like that?" the wayfarer asks. "We have never had spouses," he said, "but each one of us has a son. Each of us also has a mill and we have appointed our sons to supervise the mills. We have never looked at the mills since we built them, but our sons maintain them in good running order by keeping one eye on the mill and the other on their fathers.

The mill of tenth intellect, the Active Intellect, is a dismal place and fraught with dangers and pitfalls, consisting of four levels, i.e., the four elements: earth, water, air, and fire, for the sublunary world is so. (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, pp. 10-12)

Also in "The Red Intellect", Suhrawardi speaks of the eleven spheres by allegory of eleven mountains. The first one of the Seven Wonders of the World is the Mount Qaf that surrounds the world consisting of eleven mountains. (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, p. 22) The

Active Intellect who instructs the wayfarer approaches him as politely as possible. The wayfarer narrates:

As I looked at that person I saw that his countenance and color were red. Thinking him young, I said, "Young man, where do you come from?"

"My son," he replied, "you have addressed me mistakenly. I am the first child of creation. You call me young?!"

"Why are your features not white?" I asked.

"My features are white," he said. "I am a luminous elder. But that person who captured you in the snare and placed these disagreeable fetters on you and appointed the wardens over you threw me long ago into a black pit. This color of mine, which appears red to you, is because of that. Otherwise I am white and luminous.

In the beginning of this tale, the wayfarer was caught. He narrates himself, "one day the hunters, Fate and Destiny, laid the trap of Fore-ordination and filled it with the grain of Will, and in this manner they caught me. Then they took me from the realm where our nest was into another realm, where they stitched my eyes shut, put four different bonds on me and appointed ten wardens to watch over me." (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, p. 20.)

"The Red Intellects" describes that every white thing that is connected to light appears red when admixed with black, like the sunset at the beginning of evening or the end of dawn, which is white where it is connected to the Sun's light. One side of it is toward the light, which is white, while the other side is toward the night, which is black. Therefore it appears red. When the crescent moon rises, although its light is borrowed, it is nonetheless described as light. Since one side of it is toward day and the other side toward night, it appears red. A flame has the same quality. (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, pp. 21-22)

The white side is the allegory of the separated intelligences versus the black side is the allegory of the sublunary world. For the Active Intellect is the last Separate Intellect and is responsible for the sublunary realm, he has located between the white and the black sides.

The origin of the Active Intellect or Red Intellect is Mount Qaf which its position is above all eleven spheres.

Then the wayfarer asked the Red Intellect about wonders he has seen in the world. He answered that he has seen Seven Wonders. First of all is Mount Qaf, which is their realm, surrounding the world and consists of eleven mountains. When the wayfarer is delivered of his bondage he will go there." The second is the Pearl-that-glows-by-night that refers to the Moon. The third one is the Tuba tree that refers to the Sun. The fourth wonder is the Twelve Workshops that symbolize the sphere of Fixed Stars. The fifth is David's chain mail and it probably refers to human's body. The sixth is the sword Balarak. Maybe it symbolizes the Death. And seventh is the Spring of Life. (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, pp. 22-23)

The fourth treatise, in my account, is "On the State of Childhood" in which is some clear hints on the Moon, the Sun, the Earth, and the sphere. Moreover, the Moon is allegorized in it by the Pearl-that-glows-by-night like "The Red Intellect". (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, pp. 47-49)

I asked my master, "Does the Sun have such strength that the brightness within the Pearl-that-glows-by-night can come from it?

"It has such strength," he said "All the world is obligated to it, but no one is willing to own up to his obligation."

Then the wayfarer said when the Moon is full and the Sun and Moon are in direct opposition, it is obvious that the Earth is in between, asking "why does the Earth not block the light between the Sun and Moon as the dragon's tail does when it comes in front of the Sun or Moon?". The master clearly responded in details, not by allegories.

The fifth treatise, "On the Reality of Love", includes allegorizing nine spheres by the nine-storied pavilion.

Know that above this nine-storied pavilion is a vault called the City of the Soul. It has ramparts of might and a moat of power. At the gate to that city is stationed a young old man whose name is Jawed Khirad (Eternal Wisdom). He continually travels about in such a way that he never moves from his place. He is a good guard. He knows how to recite from the divine book and is extremely eloquent, but he is mute. He is old in years but has never seen the passage of time. He is very, very old but is still untouched by decrepitude." (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, p. 64)

The young old man is the very Active Intellect. He has never seen the passage of time because he is the tenth Separate Intellect and there is no time in its world. Consequently, he is young.

The sixth and last treatise that we want to mention is "The Language of the Ants". There are some dialogues between Enoch and all the stars and heavenly bodies. The belief in the Divine source of astronomy was traditionally attributed to the prophet Enoch or Idris some called him also Hermes. (Nasr, S., 1993, p. 132)

All the stars and heavenly bodies spoke with Enoch, who asked the Moon, "Why is your light sometimes less and sometimes more?" "You should know," answered the Moon, "that my body is pure, polished and black. I myself have no light, but when I am opposite the Sun, a likeness of its light appears in the mirror of my body in proportion to the degree of opposition, just as other corporeal forms appear in a mirror. As the degree of opposition increases I progress from the nadir of being a crescent to the zenith of being a full moon."

Enoch asked the Moon to what extent its friendship with the Sun was. It responded, "To such an extent that whenever I look upon myself as we stand opposite each other, I see the Sun." (Suhrawardi, S., 1999, pp. 88-89) The conversation goes on with no allegories.

Ibn Arabi on Celestial Bodies

Ibn Arabi (1165-1240) based on his mystical experiences added the two supreme spheres of the Divine Pedestal (al-kursi) and of the Divine Throne (al-arsh) to the nine, attributing many acts to them. (Ibn Arabi, M., 1919, p. 59) The sphere of the Divine Pedestal is created after that of the Divine Throne (Ibn Arabi, M., 2006, a, p. 149) and is very little with respect to it. (Ibn Arabi, M., 1919, p. 59) The sphere of the Divine Pedestal is located between the Divine Throne and the sky without stars, i.e., falak al-atlas. (Ibn Arabi, M., 2006, b, p. 440)

Ibn Arabi, however, focuses on the symmetry of the spheres relative to Sun. Burckhardt points that feature out:

"The Sun is not only in the centre of the six known planets -Mars, Jupiter and Saturn being further away from the Earth than the Sun, and Venus, Mercury and the Moon being closer-but beyond the sky of Saturn is situated the vault of the sky of the fixed stars or falak al-borouj or thawabit, that of the sky without stars or muhaddad al-jihat or sphere with limited aspects, and the two supreme spheres of the Divine Pedestal and of the Divine Throne, concentric spheres to which symmetrically correspond the four sub-lunar spheres of ether, of air, of water and of earth." (Burckhardt, T., 2001, p. 12)

Shahrazuri on Celestial Bodies

Muhammad Ibn Mahmud Shams al-Din al-Shahrazuri, an alleged relative of Shaykh al-Ishraq, has an important manuscript was named by himself Kitab al-Rumuz wa-l-

Amthal al-Lahutiyya fil-Anwar al-Mujarradat al-Malakutiyya. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 13) Describing this codex, Shahrazuri asserts that is a set of his unveilings and mystical experiences. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 8)

We are not to think of *Kitah al-Rumuz* as an allegorical work. However, this book is a totally none-symbolic one. In *Kitah al-Rumuz*, Shahrazuri mentions Venus one time as an example (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 261), while mentioning Sun or sunlight several times. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., pp. 71, 75, 98, 99, 105, 106, 107, 124, 131, 198, 252, 262) He also mentions Sun and planets/stars together two times (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 73, 139), when speaking of celestial body/bodies and celestial beings many times (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., pp. 4, 15, 19, 20, 40, 73, 85, 119, 159, 124, 130, 150, 199, 200, 227, 239, 247, 255, 299, 301).

Naming the celestial souls also Cherubin¹ angels (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 200), Shahrazuri discusses celestial souls in *al-Rumr*² (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., pp. 181, 204, 233, 234, 284) as well as celestial bodies² and planets/stars.³ (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 232)

Sometimes he generally speaks of the planets/stars or the light of planets/stars (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., pp. 70, 75, 110) or celestial bodies and fixed planets/stars. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 176, 236)

The light of Sun and Moon and other planets/stars is another topic of Shahrazuri's interest. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., pp. 20, 261) The order of lights begins from the sunlight, then the moonlight, then the light of Venus, then that of Jupiter, and it goes down to the smallest planet/star, having the weakest light. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 67) Becoming one light, the lights of all planets/stars are united in the sunlight and moonlight. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., pp. 68, 69) The order of bodies in respect of light commences from Sun, Moon, Venus, Jupiter, Saturn and goes down to fire, which located after celestial bodies, then located air, then water, and finally Earth. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 250)

He too considers the greater celestial sphere,⁵ (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 108) the surrounding⁶ highest⁷ sphere and the soul of surrounding highest sphere,⁸ (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., pp. 132, 242) *al-arsh* and *al-kursi*. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 236) The order souls of celestial bodies starts from the sphere of spheres, that is the great *arsh* surrounding all bodies, then the soul of the sphere of *al-thawabit*, that is *al-kursi al-karim*, then the other souls of celestial beings down to Moon. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 251)

In *al-Rumuz* of Shahrazuri, the number of celestial beings nowhere might be seen. Speaking of Divine Pedestal (*al-kursi*) and Divine Throne (*al-'arsh*) of Muhyiddin al-Andalusi, Shahrazuri does not mention *zamharir* and *ether* at all.

Conclusion

Suhrawardi's allegories on cosmology spread in his treatises. In "A Day with a Group of Sufis", the nine shells are the allegories of the nine spheres while the first shell is polished, and there are a few medallions on the second shell. On the third, fourth, and so on to the ninth shells, there is just one medallion. In "The Sound of Gabriel's Wing", eleven layers are the allegories of the eleven spheres with no crack and no crevice on the surface of the upper nine levels of the basin. The two lower ones might refer to zamharir

2 al-aflak

¹ karubi

³ al-kawakib

⁴ al-thawabit

⁵ al-aflak al-a'zam

⁶ al-moheet

⁷ al-a'la

⁸ Shahrazuri himself calls it also al-muhaddid al-jahat. (Shahrazuri, S., n.d., p. 132)

and ether. Another allegory could be seen in "The Sound of Gabriel's Wing" is the son as the soul of the sphere and the mill as the body of the sphere. In "The Red Intellect", eleven mountains, surrounded by Mount Qaf, refer to eleven spheres. The Tuba tree refers to the Sun and the Twelve Workshops refer to the sphere of fixed stars/planets. In "On the State of Childhood", there are clear hints on the Moon, the Sun, the Earth, and the sphere. And there is no allegory in it on cosmology, but the Moon is allegorized by the Pearl-that-glows-by-night like "The Red Intellect". The nine-storied pavilion is the allegory of the nine spheres in "On the Reality of Love".

Depending on the mystical disclosures, Muhyiddin al-Andalusi alias Ibn Arabi (1165–1240), added the supreme spheres of the Divine Pedestal (*al-kursi*) and of the Divine Throne (*al-arsh*) to the nine celestial spheres and imputed several jobs to them.

Suhrawardi's eleven spheres do not include Divine Pedestal and Divine Throne of Ibn Arabi. However, both Suhrawardi and Ibn Arabi stress the symmety of spheres with respect to Sun.

After all, Shams al-Din al-Shahrazuri, in his ishraqi manuscript, that is, *Kitab* al-Rumuz wa-l-Amthal al-Lahutiyya fil-Anwar al-Mujarradat al-Malakutiyya, only provides a passing look of the celestial bodies. The number of celestial beings nowhere might be seen. Speaking of Divine Pedestal (al-kursi) and Divine Throne (al-'arsh) of Muhyiddin al-Andalusi, Shahrazuri does not mention zamharir and ether at all.

References

- Al-Jami, A. (1979). The Precious Pearl Al-Jami's Al-Durrah al Fakhirah, Nicholas Heer (trans. and notes), Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Burckhardt, T. (2001). The Mystical Astrology according to Ibn 'Arabi, Bulent Rauf (trans.), Louisville: Fons Vitae.
- Chittick, W. (2001). The Heart of Islamic Philosophy: The Quest for Self-Knowledge in the Teachings of Afdal Al-Din Kashani, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Corbin, H. (1981). Creative Imagination in the Sufism of Ibn 'Arabi, trans. Ralph Manheim, Princeton: Princeton Legacy Library.
- Ibn Arabi, M. (1919). Uglat al-Mustawfiz, Leiden: Brill.
- Ibn Arabi, M. (2006). Al-Futûhât al-makkiyya, ("The Meccan Openings"), 4 vols, Beirut: Dar al-kutub al-'Ilmiyya.
- Ibn Sina, H. (2007). Kitab al-Shifa, 5 vols, Qum: Ayatollah Marashi Library.
- Kreisel, H. (2009). "From Esotericism to Science: The account of the chariot in maimonidean
 philosophy till the End of the Thirteenth Century", The Cultures of Maimonideanism: New
 Approaches to the History of Jewish Thought, James T. Robinson (ed.), Leiden: Brill, 21-56.
- Nasr, S. (1993). An Introduction to Islamic Cosmological Doctrines, New York: State University of New York Press.
- Shahrazuri, S. (n.d.). Kitab al-Rumuz wa-l-Amthal al-Lahutiyya fil-Anwar al-Mujarradat al-Malakutiyya,
 The Codex of Farid Tonecaboni at National Library of Iran, No. 19573.
- Suhrawardi, S. (1999). The Philosophical Allegories and Mystical Treatises, W. M. Thackston (ed. and trans.), Costa Mesa: Mazda Publishers.
- Suhrawardi, S. (2002a). Majmu'a-i Musannafāt-i Shaykh-i Ishrāq, vol. 1, Tehran: Pajuhishgāh-i Ulum-i Insanī Wa Mutali'at-i Farhangi Press.
- Suhrawardi, S. (2002b). Majmu'a-i Musannafat-i Shaykh-i Ishraq, vol. 2, Tehran: Pajuhishgah-i Ulum-i Insanī Wa Mutali'at-i Farhangi Press.
- Suhrawardi, S. (2002c). Majmu'a-i Musannafat-i Shaykh-i Ishraq, vol. 3, Tehran: Pajuhishgah-i Ulum-i Insani Wa Mutali'at-i Farhangi Press.